

Workshop on  
**Alternative Human Resources  
for Health in India:**  
Innovative Models for  
Improving Primary Healthcare



Hotel Taj Coromandel, Chennai  
August 21-22, 2009



## ICTPH-University of Pennsylvania, School of Nursing Partnership

**T**o increase access to healthcare services and improve health outcomes for rural populations, ICTPH partnered with the University of Pennsylvania, School of Nursing (UPenn), to pilot the functionality and viability of nurse-managed Rural Micro Counseling Centers (RMCC) in Tamil Nadu, India.

This partnership provides an opportunity for ICTPH to unlock and translate the UPenn Nursing legacy of pioneering the US Nurse Practitioner movement for the Indian subcontinent. The aim is to critically evaluate various healthcare delivery models in order to achieve the appropriate balance between technically qualified medical personnel and local village outreach health volunteers addressing observed issues of accessibility and affordability. ICTPH and UPenn endeavour to further develop Advanced Practice Nurse (APN) curriculum for India.

This partnership aims to bring together the strength of UPenn to establish and evaluate nursing models of care, and ICTPH's innovations in public health, to build nursing capacity and creatively resolve gaps in primary healthcare for rural India.

**D**espite various developments in the health sector there are real challenges in the field of human resources for health in India. One major concern is the inequitable distribution of health personnel with higher concentrations in the urban areas. Less than 10% of doctors practising modern as well as traditional medicine are available for rural healthcare and nearly 72% of Indians reside in rural areas. It is a well known fact that nations can improve health indices by strategically investing in and managing their human resources for health.

This workshop will be a unique opportunity for healthcare experts across India to meet and discuss alternative human resources with a focus on preventive and primary healthcare in India. It will also be a platform to discuss the feasibility of different types of models for effective healthcare delivery in rural and underserved urban India.

ICTPH has been working on alternative human resources in health, and through this exploratory workshop, strives to comprehend the different possibilities for task shifting from doctors to other qualified healthcare professionals. The workshop endeavours to bring about a consensus on solutions to various healthcare challenges, as well as to gather inputs from experts, and more importantly, create a forum which can work together in the future on a set of common goals.

## Primary Objectives of the Workshop

- To advocate the need for alternative human resources in India
- To explore the different possibilities for qualified human resources for health in India
- To create a consensus amongst different stakeholders on an Alternative Care Model for Healthcare delivery in India
- To build a network of professional bodies in health care in order to convert our efforts into a sustainable process in the future



This workshop will be a unique opportunity for healthcare experts across India to meet and discuss alternative human resources with a focus on preventive and primary healthcare in India.



## Itinerary

### DAY 1

09:30-10:00	Registration and Coffee
10:00-10:30	<i>Welcome Remarks:</i> Dr. Nachiket Mor
10:30-10:45	<i>Introduction to ICTPH:</i> Dr. Zeena Johar, President, ICTPH
10:45-11:00	<i>Penn Nursing Overview:</i> Prof. Eileen M. Sullivan-Marx
11:00-11:30	<i>General Overview on Human Resources for Health in India:</i> Dr. D. Thammarao
11:30-13:00	<b>Panel Discussion: Challenges in Healthcare Delivery with the Present State of Human Resources</b>
	This session will help us gain a common understanding of the main challenges that face the Indian Health Care System, particularly with regard to the state of human resources available to rural and urban, under-served populations.
	<i>Primary Health Care Delivery in Rural India:</i> Dr. H. Sudarshan
	<i>Multiskilling Nurses for Equitable Access to Maternal and Newborn Health Services:</i> Dr. Geetha Rana
	<i>Potential Healthcare Delivery Models for Delivering Primary Care in Rural India:</i> Dr. Jachin Velavan
	Chair: Prof. Dileep Mavlinkar
13:00-14:00	Lunch
14:00-15:30	<b>Panel Discussion: Some Potential Alternative Models for Delivering Primary Healthcare to Rural India</b>
	This session would provide clarity on what the different alternative models for healthcare delivery in India are, both operationally as well as conceptually. Our speakers share their experiences in pioneering such innovative models, learning from their success or failure, as well as proposing new models that will potentially be successful in the Indian context.
	<i>The Assam Model of Rural Health Practitioners:</i> Dr. Adinath Sarmah
	<i>The NP Programme in CMC Vellore:</i> Prof. Rosaline Jayakaran
	<i>Alternative Health Force and Women's Health: From Womb to Tomb:</i> Prof. S. Chhabra
	Chair: Dr. Rajaratnam Abel

## Itinerary

15:30-16:30	Coffee and Breakout Session: <b>Topics in building an Alternative Health Workforce</b>
	Participants will break into four groups of five or six people each; and every group will be assigned one of the following issues regarding <b>building a qualified alternative health workforce</b> in India. This interactive, brainstorming session aims to result in new and innovative ideas, as well as allows the participants to pitch in their thoughts freely with each other. The discussion will be based on the following:
	Group One: Skill Mix
	Group Two: Incentives
	Group Three: Infrastructure
	Group Four: Population Attitudes
16:30-17:00	Summaries from the Sessions
17:00-18:30	<b>Panel Discussion: Government Policies and Legal Issues in Alternative Human Resources for Health</b>
	Policies as well as the legal regulations of India, are central to understanding the feasibility of alternate human resources in health. This session will provide clarity as to the relationship between the politico-legal and the health system in this country.
	<i>Government Policies: The Changes Required:</i> Prof. Dileep Mavlankar
	<i>Legal Issues involving Nurses in India:</i> Dr. Josephine Littleflower
	<i>Launch of NP Model in Gujarat:</i> Ms. Jasu S. Patidar
	Chair: Dr. Padmanaban
18:30	Workshop Day 1 ends
20:00	Networking Dinner

## Itinerary

### DAY 2

09:00-09:30	Coffee
09:30-10:00	<i>Nurse Practitioner: The International Experience</i> : Inaugural Lecture: Prof. Eileen M. Sullivan-Marx
10:00-11:00	<b>Panel Discussion: The Expanding Role of Nurses: The NP Model</b>
	This session will give us insight into the current state of nurses in the Indian healthcare system, as well as explore their diversifying role in the current context. This session will also help us understand the Nurse Practitioner Model which prevails in many countries around the world, and will help us consider whether it is a viable alternative model to adopt in the Indian situation.
	<i>The Expanding Role of Nurses in India</i> : Mr. Vinoy Manning
	<i>Nurse Practitioner Model for Rural India</i> : Ms. Srilatha Sivalenka
	Chair: Prof. Dileep Mavlinkar
11:00-11:15	Break for Coffee
11:15-12:30	<b>Panel Discussion: Training and Education of Nurse Practitioners</b>
	This final session will help all participants to engage in a discussion regarding the Nurse Practitioner Model and focus on ways in which this model may be implemented in the future in India. Educational curriculum, training, recruitment, and retention will be some of the key topics of conversation in this session.
	<i>The Nurse Practitioner in the USA: A Case Report</i> : Ms. Kellie McNerney
	<i>Revisiting the Graduate Nursing Curriculum in India</i> : Prof. Rosaline Jayakaran
	<i>Emerging NP Curriculum in the USA: Lessons Learnt</i> : Prof. Eileen M. Sullivan-Marx
12:30-13:00	<i>Development of a Consensus Statement</i> : Prof. Eileen M. Sullivan-Marx and Dr. Padmanaban
13:00-13:15	Reflections by the Press
13:15-13:30	Vote of Thanks: Dr. Zeena Johar
13:30	Lunch and End of Workshop

## Speaker Profiles

**Dr. Adinath Sarmah** is a psychiatrist by qualification and has worked in several rural areas in Assam for nearly 30 years. He is presently the Principal of Medical Institute in Jorhat, Assam which runs the Diploma in Medicine and Rural Health Care which is one among its kind in India.

**Dr. Dileep V. Mavalankar** works as an Associate Professor, Center for Management of Health Services, Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad, India. He specializes in medicine and public health, and underwent his MPH and DrPH programmes at Johns Hopkins University, USA. His areas of interest include management of primary health care and family planning programmes, quality of care, reproductive healthcare, and management of services. He has delivered lectures at several health and management institutes. Dr Mavalankar has published several journal articles, book chapters and working papers. He has developed courses on services management & health and hospital management for PGP students, and teaches course on public management to FPM students. His current work includes management of maternal health programs, quality of health services and top management capacity for health. He is also a consultant to several international organizations including Columbia University, WHO, UNICEF, CARE, Aga Khan Foundation, UNDP/World Bank and government of India's health and family welfare departments and state governments. Dr Mavalankar has been a member of several programmes & scientific advisory committees including Mother Care project USA; NIHFW, New Delhi; IIPS, Mumbai; IIHMR Jaipur; IMM PAC Project University of Aberdeen UK etc. He was also appointed by the Prime Minister to the Missions Steering Group of the National Rural Health Mission constituted by the Government of India.

**Dr Eileen M. Sullivan-Marx** is an Associate Professor and Associate Dean for Practice & Community Affairs at the University of Pennsylvania School Of Nursing. Dr. Sullivan-Marx launched a career as a primary care nurse practitioner in 1980. Throughout the following two decades she led new practices for nurse practitioners and in 1988 established an independent nurse practitioner practice in rural New Hampshire in the northeastern US. Today she is an active international and national consultant on nurse practitioners and oversees the School's practice and community mission. Dr. Sullivan-Marx is an expert on health financing for nurse practitioner and nursing care. She is currently the Chairperson for a state government commission on senior care services.

**Dr. T Geetha Rana** is a public health specialist with nearly a decade of experience in providing technical support to national reproductive, safe motherhood and newborn health programmes, seven of which were at UNICEF Nepal and subsequently at a regional level, providing technical assistance to UNICEF offices in South Asia. She is presently working with the National Health Systems Resource Centre, and AMDD/ IIM-Ahmedabad. She is an accomplished obstetrician and gynecologist with several publications in the subject to her credit. Dr Geetha has been trained in both the developing and developed world and has been involved in several teaching and training activities in India as well as abroad.

**Padmashree Dr. Hanumappa Sudarshan** is one of the most well known figures in public health in India. In the 30 years he has worked with the Soligas, he has achieved remarkable feats, far beyond any government efforts that have been done. The Swedish parliament

awarded him the Right Livelihood Award (Alternate Nobel Prize) in 1994, and Dr.Sudarshan donated the entire award money to the betterment of the Soligas. The Vivekananda Girijana Kalyana Kendra, which he set up in 1981, has blossomed into a sustainable tribal development program with few peers anywhere in the country. In 1986, he founded Karuna Trust for integrated rural development through health, education and livelihood security. The trust now focuses on strengthening primary health care through Public-private Partnerships in 4 states, where it runs public primary health centers, addressing gaps in these remote centers through its own innovations - telemedicine, health insurance and integration of mental health to name a few. He has shared his wide experience by volunteering with the Government through his Chairmanship of the Karnataka Governments' Task Force on Health & Family welfare as well as leading a 'battle' against the 'epidemic of corruption' as the Director of the Lokayukta in that state.

**Dr. Jachin Velavan** is a Family Physician, with a special interest in Primary Healthcare in Rural India. She has worked over the last 13 years in many rural hospitals in Orissa, Assam, Bihar and Tamil Nadu, and is presently developing a Distance Education Program for community leaders in Primary Healthcare through the Department of Distance Education, Christian Medical College, Vellore, especially to empower them to help the huge masses of our country who live without any access to healthcare. The Department of Distance Education is also committed to empowering General Practitioners all over India through the Distance Education Programme, 'Post Graduate Diploma in Family Medicine (PGDFM).'

**Ms Jasu S Patidar** is the Registrar of the Gujarat Nursing Council. She has been actively involved in several activities in the field of nursing for nearly three decades and has a wide range of experience from being the Principal of a school of nursing, professor of nursing in the college of nursing in Ahmedabad as well as a member of several national and international bodies in nursing. Ms Patidar is also a member in a national level committee that is looking into the revision of curricula for different nursing programmes in India. Ms Patidar is playing a pivotal role in the newly formed programme on Nurse Practitioners in Midwifery in the state of Gujarat.

**Dr G Josephine R Little Flower** is presently working as the Registrar of the Tamil Nadu Nursing Council and has been very actively involved in the field of Nursing for more than 20 years. Dr Josephine has a PhD in Nursing, a bachelors degree in General Law, MBA in health care and hospital management, MPhil in sociology, Masters in Psychology apart from diplomas in hospital administration and public health administration. Apart from being a nursing administrator Dr Josephine has been actively involved with several organizations in India and has a host of publications to her credit on nursing in India.

**Ms Kellie Mc Nerney** is a Nurse Practitioner from the state of California in the USA. She graduated from her Bachelors RN program in 1977 and her MSN/Family Nurse Practitioner program in 1988 from the University of California at San Francisco (UCSF). She has been working at the University of California for over 17 years in various settings, general internal medicine, ambulatory care, student health and most recently at a health care for the homeless clinic in San Francisco. She is also a Clinical Assistant Professor at UCSF and is currently working as an Advanced Practice Nurse with ICTPH as a part of a partnership between the University of Pennsylvania School Of Nursing and ICTPH.

**Dr Nachiket Mor** is a Yale World Fellow (2004); has a Ph.D. in Economics from the University of Pennsylvania with a specialization in Finance from the Wharton School; a Masters degree in Management from the Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad and an undergraduate degree in Physics from the Mumbai University. While completing his Ph.D., he was associated with a Philadelphia based hedge fund (Quantitative Financial Strategies) for three years. He has worked with ICICI since 1987 in a variety of jobs, including, Corporate Planning, Project Finance, Treasury and Rural Banking and was a member of ICICI Bank's Board from 2001-2007. He is currently President of the ICICI Foundation for Inclusive Growth. In addition to his work with the ICICI Foundation, he is a member of the Boards of CRISIL, RUDI (SEWA), FINO, IndiaMart, Shorecap Exchange (USA) and the India Advisory Board of Intuit (USA).

**Dr. P. Padmanaban** is a well known public health specialist in India, and is presently the Advisor (Public Health Administration) at the National Health Systems Resource Centre, National Rural Health Mission. He was the Director of Public Health & Preventive Medicine in Tamil Nadu and has been actively involved in the health systems of India. He is a very strong proponent of task shifting for rural health care delivery in India. He has been instrumental in creating very successful models of rural health care delivery in Tamil Nadu, especially in the field of obstetrics.

**Dr. Rajaratnam Abel** completed his medical studies from Christian Medical College (CMC) Vellore, Tamilnadu in 1971. After a period of service in different mission hospitals in Nepal, Ranchi, Pune, Nuzvid and Andhra Pradesh, he joined the Rural Unit for Health and Social Affairs (RUSHA), a Department of CMC in 1978. During his stay in RUHSA he completed his Master of Public Health from The Johns Hopkins University, USA and then his PhD from Chennai. At RUHSA he was responsible for planning and leading a Primary Health Care programme in KV Kuppam Block of Vellore District. Two of his related publications to the workshop theme are "RUHSA - A Model Primary Health Care Programme." and "Alternative Models of Health Care Delivery." Currently he is retired and works as a Public Health Consultant.

**Prof. Rosaline Jayakaran** is a professor in Community Health Nursing and the Head of the Community Health Nursing Dept. in College of Nursing CMC Vellore. She is also the Deputy Dean of College of Nursing. She has been in the community health field since 1978 and is presently pursuing a PhD. She has been involved with the development of the curriculum for Fellowship in Family Nurse Practice. She has been a part of several academic trips particularly to several universities in the US in order to develop curricula for nursing education in India.

**Dr. Shakuntala Chhabra** is a renowned academician and is presently the Director, Professor of Obstetrics Gynaecology, & Dean of one the premier medical institutions in India- MGIMS, Sevagram, Wardha. Apart from administration she has been actively involved in research and has taught undergraduate and post graduate medical and nursing students for more than 30 years. She is involved with several universities and teaching institutions around the world as a faculty and is the principal investigator for several research projects in India and abroad. She has worked as a consultant to numerous organizations like the WHO and for several countries. She is a pioneer in the field of women's health and has been instrumental in launching several projects in this field. She is also the Chief Executive Officer



of Women and Children Welfare Centre 'Aakanksha' Center for keeping Delinquished Babies and Their Adoption, Chief Coordinator of Emergency Obstetric Care (EmOC), Chairperson of Board of Studies Modern Medicine Clinical II, Rashtrasant Tukdoji Maharaj, Nagpur University and a Member of Women's Health Task Force Global Health Through Education Training Service, USA.

**Srilatha Sivalenka** is presently working with Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) Global AIDS program as a Scientific Affairs Specialist based in Hyderabad. She has more than thirteen years of Public Health experience working in India. Before joining CDC she worked as Program Manager, Japanese Encephalitis at PATH, a Seattle based international NGO, where she was managing entire South India as well as Maharashtra. She worked for more than seven years as Faculty in Quality Assurance in Health Care, in Institute of Health Systems, an autonomous research and educational institution engaged in public health research, training and consultancy. She provided consultancy services as Research Officer, Administrative Staff College (ASCI) for one and half years. She got trained in health policy and development programmes on policy formulation from Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad, and International Classification of Disease- (ICD) 10 by World Health Organization. She has presented many papers in both national and international conferences and has research publications in reputed national and international journals. She has a Masters from Osmania University in Social sciences and a Bachelors degree in Nursing from University of Health Sciences, AP. She is a recipient of the United States Agency for international Development (USAID) award for her outstanding performance in the Nursing. She is a Taro Takemi Fellow from Harvard School of Public Health, Harvard University, United States from 2001- 2002.

**Dr. D. Thamma Rao** is presently working as a Senior Advisor with the National Health Systems Research Centre under the NRHM in New Delhi. In his career spanning over more than 35 years Dr Thamma Rao has held several positions of repute in India and abroad. He was the Mission Director, NRHM, Govt. of Pondicherry, Director, PK Medical College, Govt. Of Pondicherry, Dean, Mother Theresa Institute of Health Sciences, Director of Health & Family Welfare Services, Pondicherry apart from several other senior positions. He is an anesthesiologist by qualification and has undergone post graduate programmes in hospital administration, health service management in developing countries (UK) and population in emergencies. He is presently involved in developing human resources for health at the NHSRC.

**Mr. Vinoj Manning** joined Ipas in March 2002 as Advisor, Product Promotion and Distribution, and was responsible for the market development of appropriate technologies for safe abortions. He was appointed Country Director in January 2009. Prior to joining Ipas, he managed a relief and rehabilitation program implemented by the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation in response to the Orissa cyclone. He has worked with a variety of organizations including PATH, International Development Enterprises, and the National Dairy Development Board. Vinoj has a bachelor's degree in business management and a postgraduate diploma in rural management.

IKP Centre for Technologies in Public Health (ICTPH) is a not-for-profit research centre that aims to improve the health of poor populations by focusing on designing, developing and delivering innovative solutions in healthcare concerning India and the developing world – through an inclusive process that scientifically integrates knowledge of factors influencing health and diseases in India, regular evaluation and impact assessment of existing health systems – and integration of appropriate technology for optimal healthcare delivery.

With our mission to provide 'Access to Health', we aim to deliver affordable, reliable and sustainable healthcare solutions to rural populations. We have a three-pronged strategy for achieving the envisaged goals – our three verticals – Human Capacity, Epidemiology, and Healthcare Solutions.

The Human Capacity vertical at ICTPH has a mandate to understand the need for innovation for human resources in health in India and create models for development and efficient utilisation of the skills and knowledge of the health workforce.

The Epidemiological focus of ICTPH is to study the health and illnesses of the population and various factors that affect them. It also seeks to explore unmet healthcare needs and household level health-care expenditures that both reflect the extent of gaps in health-care access as well as affordability.

The Healthcare Solutions team endeavours to apply the learnings from all of ICTPH's research activities. The goal is to suggest ways to enhance the delivery of effective solutions to populations which face a crisis of accessibility, using the tools of finance and technology.



**IKP Centre for Technologies in Public Health (ICTPH)**  
1, Cenotaph Road, Teynampet,  
Chennai - 600018. India